

Australian Economic Comment

Free to View
Economics

From mining tax to subsidy in 15 years

Australia

- ◆ Oh, how the policy environment has changed. Fifteen years ago, the national policy discussion was about introducing a 'resources super profits tax'. Resource companies were making very high profits from Australia's resources exports driven by a China-led commodity prices "super-cycle" of the early 2000s. Fast forward to now, and Australian fiscal policymakers have proposed a subsidy scheme of tax credits to support the critical minerals and hydrogen export industries. This comes at a time when Australia's terms of trade have been even higher than they were 15 years ago. Quite a shift. Why? Read on.

Paul Bloxham
Chief Economist, Australia,
New Zealand & Global
Commodities
HSBC Bank Australia Limited

First, a brief history. In the first decade of this century, China's demand for resources seemed insatiable and commodity prices rose to multi-decade highs driving Australia's terms of trade to, at the time, record highs. Australia had its largest mining investment boom ever – markedly bigger than anything before it – mining profits were very high and nominal growth in the whole economy was very strong.

In 2009, the Henry tax review – a landmark tax system review – was published and, in 2010, amongst its 138 recommendations, the government of the day endorsed only three, including a 'Resources Super Profits tax'. The Henry review suggested that 'a rent-based tax would ensure the right levels of exploration and extraction and provide sufficient encouragement for private sector participation'. Treasury noted at the time that this was consistent with trends in developed countries, with Norway being the most relevant example.

After all, these resources were, in principle, national wealth.

However, Australia did not introduce the resources super-profits tax. Instead, a smaller version, the mineral resources rent tax arrived in 2012, to then, with a change of government two years later, in 2014, be repealed.

As a point of comparison, Norway has a sovereign wealth fund that is now worth around 350% of its GDP, and net government assets of over 100% of GDP. Australia's national net *debt* (including the states) is around 32% of GDP – which is low by global standards, but far from a net asset position.

Fast forward 15 years and the policy proposal is quite different even though Australia's terms of trade is around levels that are even higher than they were fifteen years ago.

The policy environment has shifted such that last week's budget included a proposed *tax credit scheme* for producers and processors of critical minerals and hydrogen as part of the 'Future Made in Australia' industry policy initiative.

This is a Free to View version of a report with the same title published on 20-May-24. Please contact your HSBC representative or email AskResearch@hsbc.com for more information.

Disclosures & Disclaimer: This report must be read with the disclosures and the analyst certifications in the Disclosure appendix, and with the Disclaimer, which forms part of it.

Issuer of report: HSBC Bank Australia Limited

View HSBC Global Research at: <https://www.research.hsbc.com>

This initiative, albeit yet to be legislated, includes a range of elements, including subsidies to support onshore production of solar panels and quantum computing, but the largest part is a tax credit scheme for critical minerals processors and hydrogen producers, with these tax credits costed at \$A13.7bn over ten years.

This is designed to help to re-focus the economy on new growth engines that help the country to take advantage of the global energy transition by shifting the export base.

We have written extensively about Australia's 'super-power' opportunity.

Australia's geography – with lots of sun, wind and empty space – gives the country a comparative advantage in the production of renewable energy.

The question is not whether these are growth opportunities – they clearly are – but rather, how policy should be best set to take advantage of these opportunities.

One approach is to make the economy as flexible as possible to thereby encourage the private sector to invest. This should include ensuring regulatory hurdles are appropriate but not overly burdensome, that skill-workers are available and that the jobs market is flexible, that the tax system is efficient and transparent, and that the price signals in the economy are appropriate.

Another approach is to directly fund projects using public funds, for example, through subsidies and tax credit schemes.

These paths are not mutually exclusive. Elements of both approaches would help to achieve the objective.

As described above, last week's budget contained subsidy measures and tax credits.

However, there was very little focus in the budget on productivity enhancing policies – the word 'productivity' was not used once in the Treasurer, Jim Chalmers, budget speech. As we wrote before the budget, a focus on productivity enhancing policy is much needed in Australia.

A key rationale for the subsidies approach is that other countries have stepped up with significant industry subsidies too, including the US with its Inflation-Reduction Act, and that without public subsidies, Australia may not be able to compete to attract investment. That is, the comparative advantage and profitable opportunities may not be enough incentive on their own – a public subsidy is also needed, or investment could go elsewhere.

On that front, a design feature of tax credits is that they would only benefit projects that get off the ground. It's not 'picking winners', as much as 'supporting winners'.

The way the tax credits would work is to be factored into the likely returns that a critical minerals processor or hydrogen producer should expect to get once the operation is running and profitable. That is, it would lower the estimated 'hurdle rate' for investment, with the idea that this encourages the investment to happen.

But here is the interesting turn.

Once the project is profitable, the operator then pays less tax (gets a tax credit) – even if there are super profits.

The opposite of a super profits tax.

Quite a shift in the national policy approach in just 15 years.

Disclosure appendix

The following analyst(s), who is(are) primarily responsible for this document, certifies(y) that the opinion(s), views or forecasts expressed herein accurately reflect their personal view(s) and that no part of their compensation was, is or will be directly or indirectly related to the specific recommendation(s) or views contained in this research report: Paul Bloxham and Jamie Culling

This document has been issued by the Research Department of HSBC.

HSBC and its affiliates will from time to time sell to and buy from customers the securities/instruments, both equity and debt (including derivatives) of companies covered in HSBC Research on a principal or agency basis or act as a market maker or liquidity provider in the securities/instruments mentioned in this report.

Analysts, economists, and strategists are paid in part by reference to the profitability of HSBC which includes investment banking, sales & trading, and principal trading revenues.

Whether, or in what time frame, an update of this analysis will be published is not determined in advance.

For disclosures in respect of any company mentioned in this report, please see the most recently published report on that company available at www.hsbcnet.com/research.

Additional disclosures

- 1 This report is dated as at 20 May 2024.
- 2 All market data included in this report are dated as at close 20 May 2024, unless a different date and/or a specific time of day is indicated in the report.
- 3 HSBC has procedures in place to identify and manage any potential conflicts of interest that arise in connection with its Research business. HSBC's analysts and its other staff who are involved in the preparation and dissemination of Research operate and have a management reporting line independent of HSBC's Investment Banking business. Information Barrier procedures are in place between the Investment Banking, Principal Trading, and Research businesses to ensure that any confidential and/or price sensitive information is handled in an appropriate manner.
- 4 You are not permitted to use, for reference, any data in this document for the purpose of (i) determining the interest payable, or other sums due, under loan agreements or under other financial contracts or instruments, (ii) determining the price at which a financial instrument may be bought or sold or traded or redeemed, or the value of a financial instrument, and/or (iii) measuring the performance of a financial instrument or of an investment fund.

Disclaimer

This document has been issued by HSBC Bank Australia Limited, which has based this document on information obtained from sources it believes to be reliable but which it has not independently verified. Neither HSBC Bank Australia Limited nor any member of its group companies ("HSBC") make any guarantee, representation or warranty nor accept any responsibility or liability as to the accuracy or completeness of this document and is not responsible for errors of transmission of factual or analytical data, nor is HSBC liable for damages arising out of any person's reliance on this information. The information and opinions contained within the report are based upon publicly available information at the time of publication, represent the present judgment of HSBC and are subject to change without notice.

This document is not and should not be construed as an offer to sell or solicitation of an offer to purchase or subscribe for any investment or other investment products mentioned in it and/or to participate in any trading strategy. It does not constitute a prospectus or other offering document. Information in this document is general and should not be construed as personal advice, given it has been prepared without taking account of the objectives, financial situation or needs of any particular investor. Accordingly, investors should, before acting on it, consider the appropriateness of the information, having regard to their objectives, financial situation and needs. If necessary, seek professional investment and tax advice.

The decision and responsibility on whether or not to purchase, subscribe or sell (as applicable) must be taken by the investor. In no event will any member of the HSBC group be liable to the recipient for any direct or indirect or any other damages of any kind arising from or in connection with reliance on any information and materials herein.

Past performance is not necessarily a guide to future performance. The value of any investment or income may go down as well as up and you may not get back the full amount invested. Where an investment is denominated in a currency other than the local currency of the recipient of the research report, changes in the exchange rates may have an adverse effect on the value, price or income of that investment. In case of investments for which there is no recognised market it may be difficult for investors to sell their investments or to obtain reliable information about its value or the extent of the risk to which it is exposed. Some of the statements contained in this document may be considered forward looking statements which provide current expectations or forecasts of future events. Such forward looking statements are not guarantees of future performance or events and involve risks and uncertainties. Actual results may differ materially from those described in such forward-looking statements as a result of various factors.

This document is for information purposes only and may not be redistributed or passed on, directly or indirectly, to any other person, in whole or in part, for any purpose. The distribution of this document in other jurisdictions may be restricted by law, and persons into whose possession this document comes should inform themselves about, and observe, any such restrictions. By accepting this report, you agree to be bound by the foregoing instructions. If this report is received by a customer of an affiliate of HSBC, its provision to the recipient is subject to the terms of business in place between the recipient and such affiliate. The document is intended to be distributed in its entirety. Unless governing law permits otherwise, you must contact a HSBC Group member in your home jurisdiction if you wish to use HSBC Group services in effecting a transaction in any investment mentioned in this document.

Certain investment products mentioned in this document may not be eligible for sale in some states or countries, and they may not be suitable for all types of investors. Investors should consult with their HSBC representative regarding the suitability of the investment products mentioned in this document.

HSBC and/or its officers, directors and employees may have positions in any securities in companies mentioned in this document. HSBC may act as market maker or may have assumed an underwriting commitment in the securities of companies discussed in this document (or in related investments), may sell or buy securities and may also perform or seek to perform investment banking or underwriting services for or relating to those companies and may also be represented on the supervisory board or any other committee of those companies.

From time to time research analysts conduct site visits of covered issuers. HSBC policies prohibit research analysts from accepting payment or reimbursement for travel expenses from the issuer for such visits.

In Australia, this publication has been distributed by The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited (ABN 65 117 925 970, AFSL 301737) for the general information of its "wholesale" customers (as defined in the Corporations Act 2001). Where distributed to retail customers, this research is distributed by HSBC Bank Australia Limited (ABN 48 006 434 162 AFSL No. 232595).

© Copyright 2024, HSBC Bank Australia Limited, ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, on any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of insert issuing entity name. . MCI (P) 061/09/2023, MCI (P) 073/10/2023, MCI (P) 007/10/2023, MCI (P) 008/01/2024