

By: Devendra Joshi

September 2021 www.research.hsbc.com

SPOTLIGHT

# ESG – an Asian frontier market primer

Vietnam and Bangladesh – seeking greener pastures

We look at ESG trends in two Asian frontier markets; both countries face very real threats from climate change

Vietnam and Bangladesh need to develop their capital markets to sustain high levels of growth

Increasing foreign investment will force companies to put a greater emphasis on sustainability

This is an abridged version of a report by the same title published on 13 September 2021. Please contact your HSBC representative or email <u>AskResearch@hsbc.com</u> for more information.



**Disclosures & Disclaimer:** This report must be read with the disclosures and the analyst certifications in the Disclosure appendix, and with the Disclaimer, which forms part of it.



## Why read this report?

- We present an ESG primer on two frontier markets Vietnam and Bangladesh
- Both countries are highly vulnerable to the impact of climate change
- Foreign investment is needed to support growth we look at how overseas capital will embed ESG practices in the corporate world

Devendra Joshi Equity Strategist, ASEAN and Frontier Markets The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited

This is the latest report in a series of reports HSBC Global Research has published that stress the importance of using an integrated approach for ESG analysis, rather than some form of simplistic scoring system. This report expands our coverage by providing an ESG primer on two Asian frontier markets – Vietnam and Bangladesh. We present a one-stop guide for investors, covering:

- Climate change challenges and the measures being taken to offset the threats
- Green financing landscape
- Corporate governance codes and their comparison with OECD practices
- Progress being made to meet the UN's 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)
- ESG indicators of companies in the VN30 Index and the DS30 Index

At the front line of climate change. According to the World Bank, Vietnam is one of the top five countries likely to be affected by climate change and Bangladesh is also extremely vulnerable. We assess the initiatives being taken in both countries to combat the threats, as well as their fledgling green financing programmes.

**Foreign investment and corporate governance.** Vietnam and Bangladesh are starting to get to grips with the governance and social elements of ESG. Many investors will be surprised to know that both countries have detailed corporate governance codes. Foreign investment is helping to embed ESG practices in the corporate world. To sustain strong economic growth, both countries will need to develop their respective capital markets and foreign capital has a key role to play. For example, Vietnam has the highest level of investment in renewable energy across ASEAN and its stock market already has a sustainability index.

Why these markets matter. We have long seen Vietnam as one of the region's best investment stories. The country is not only a growing base for supply chains, it is also assembling a homegrown economic growth engine that is making Vietnam an even more attractive destination in its own right. Vietnam is also the most liquid equity market in ASEAN after Thailand. Daily average trade turnover is now double that of both Singapore and Indonesia. Bangladesh's market, though smaller and less liquid, is on a similar growth trajectory to Vietnam but has a larger economy and population and is growing at a faster pace. In our view, Bangladesh is one of Asia's most exciting long-term demographic stories.



## Contents

Why read this report?	1
Facts and figures	3
ESG and frontier markets	4
A timely reminder	4
What ESG means for frontier equity markets	5
ESG and sustainability practices	5
Sustainability indices in Vietnam	8
Climate change, responses, and green financing	I 9
Investors will demand more from businesses	9
Vietnam and Bangladesh: Trackin sustainable development goals	g 10
Vietnam – climate challenges and responses	10
Bangladesh – climate change challenges and actions taken	11
Green financing	12
Green financing in Bangladesh	13
References	14
Corporate governance codes	15
Making progress	15
ESG indicators for major companies	17
Analysing trends using the HSBC ESG Database	17
Disclosure appendix	18
Disclaimer	21



## **Facts and figures**

# 3.5%

The World Bank's estimate of how much Vietnam's national income could be reduced by climate change by 2050

# 79%

The percentage of investors in Asia Pacific that increased their ESG investments significantly in 2020 (according to MSCI)

Of the United Nation's 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), Vietnam is on track to achieve five and Bangladesh three, but both countries are close to hitting targets for another 6-7

# 51<sup>st</sup> and 109<sup>th</sup>

Where Vietnam and Bangladesh rank on the UN's Sustainability Development Index out of 165 countries

## 8%

Vietnam's target for reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions by 2030 5%

Bangladesh's GHG emission reduction target for 2030 (base year 2011) 15%

The minimum target set for sustainable financing as a % of total loans in Bangladesh

# USD128.3bn

Total proposed investment for Vietnam's National Power Development Plan (2021-30) Of the USD128.3bn, USD95.4bn is for power generation and USD32.9bn for power grids; for 2031-45, proposed investment totals USD192.3bn

# USD650bn

Total infrastructure investment needed in Bangladesh in 2016-40 to meet the SDGs; current investment amounts to only USD417bn, leaving a gap of USD233bn

# USD30bn

How much the Global Green Growth Institute estimates Vietnam needs to implement a green growth strategy by 2030





## **ESG and frontier markets**

- We look at ESG trends and landscape in Vietnam and Bangladesh
- Both countries face very real threats from climate change and also need to develop their capital markets to sustain high levels of growth
- The increase in foreign investment will lead to a greater emphasis on sustainability in these markets

#### A timely reminder

HSBC's Wai-Shin Chan did not mince his words after the UN's climate change body released its latest report which stated that it was now "unequivocal" that human influence has warmed the atmosphere, ocean and land. Wai-Shin Chan, Head of the HSBC's Climate Change Centre of Excellence and Global Head of ESG Research, wrote that: "*Investors will demand much more of businesses. For those in high-carbon activities to rethink business models and strategies; for industries to be more innovative in lower carbon solutions; for all segments of the economy to prepare for the impacts of climate change."* 

With attention rapidly turning to the upcoming COP26 meeting in Glasgow in November, climate change will remain high on the agenda. Just ask Vietnam and Bangladesh. There is no doubt that the "E" in ESG is of prime importance to both countries, which are all too familiar with the threats from climate change: floods and storm damage. The World Bank believes Vietnam is one of the top five countries likely to be affected and estimates that climate change will reduce the country's national income by up to 3.5% by 2050<sup>1</sup>. Bangladesh is extremely vulnerable as well. We assess the initiatives to combat climate change that are being taken in both countries, as well as their fledgling green financing programmes.

However, the "S" and "G" elements of ESG are also increasingly relevant to Vietnam and Bangladesh, frontier markets that are starting to get to grips with governance and social factors. Many investors will be surprised to know that both countries already have detailed corporate governance codes and are heading in the right direction in terms of meeting many of the UN's 17 SDGs.

This report looks at how foreign investment is likely to help embed ESG practices in the corporate world. To sustain strong economic growth, Vietnam and Bangladesh will need to develop their respective capital markets and foreign capital has a key role to play. For example, Vietnam has the highest level of investment in renewable energy across ASEAN. Using HSBC's ESG database, we look at leading companies in Vietnam's VN30 Index and Bangladesh's DS30 Index and gauge how they have made improvements in various ESG indicators over the past five years. Surprisingly, Vietnam's stock market already has a sustainability index.

Both countries already have detailed corporate governance codes

Investors will demand much

more of businesses



Vietnam and Bangladesh

provide fertile ground for

investors looking for growth

# What ESG means for frontier equity markets

- Companies are facing greater pressure to conform to sustainability standards
- This will improve the pricing of risk
- Vietnam already has a sustainability index

#### **ESG and sustainability practices**

#### The development of capital markets along the lines of ESG principles

Vietnam and Bangladesh have seen their respective economies expand rapidly in the last decade, providing fertile ground to investors looking for growth. To sustain these levels of growth, both countries will need to develop their respective capital markets and foreign capital has a key role to play. With the growing importance of ESG investing, there will be greater pressure on companies in these markets to conform to ESG standards, focus on sustainable growth, and provide more disclosure on ESG issues.





Source: CEIC, HSBC estimates. Note: BD - Bangladesh, VN - Vietnam

### Vietnam has higher per capita income, while Bangladesh is growing faster



Source: CEIC, HSBC estimates. Note: BD - Bangladesh, VN - Vietnam.





#### Capital market penetration remains low (2020)

Source: AsianBondsOnline, Vietnam Ministry of Finance, Bangladesh Bank, Bloomberg

#### Better risk pricing, reduction in uncertainty risk premium

Equity markets in Vietnam and Bangladesh generally generate higher earnings growth than most emerging and developed market peers; however, investors often shy away due to concerns about sub-standard financial reporting and what they perceive to be conflicting regulations, an investment risk often associated with frontier markets. Investors ascribe a higher risk premium to account for this uncertainty but as corporate disclosure improves, so should investor sentiment.



#### Higher growth but foreign investors shy away due to concerns about governance issues

Source: Bloomberg, FactSet, Refinitiv Datastream, HSBC. Note: BD - Bangladesh, VN - Vietnam, DM - Developed Markets, AxJ - Asia ex Japan, EM - Emerging Markets.

#### Multinational domino effect on sustainability practices of listed companies

Foreign direct investment (FDI) and exports are key drivers of Vietnam's economic growth. For example, the country is one of the major beneficiaries of the reshuffling of Asia's supply chains and also receives the most FDI in ASEAN as measured by the percentage of GDP. Given the increasing focus of global companies on ESG and sustainability, they are demanding more and better quality sustainable resources in the countries where they operate.

Look no further than renewable energy. Vietnam has seen the highest level of investment in renewable energy across ASEAN. To attract more FDI and provide overseas companies with more sustainable energy, Vietnam has demonstrated a strong commitment to renewables. HSBC Global Research analyst Rahul Bhatia argues that Vietnam offers the best potential for renewable capacity addition across ASEAN, with foreign investments driving growth.





#### Vietnam receives the most FDI in ASEAN (after Singapore) as a percentage of GDP (2020)

Source: CEIC, HSBC. Note: VN - Vietnam, MY - Malaysia, ID - Indonesia, PH - Philippines, TH - Thailand.



#### Renewable\* capacity addition by ASEAN economy (in GW) - highest in Vietnam

Source: Regulatory websites, HSBC estimates. Note: \*Renewables here include Solar, Wind, Waste-to-Energy, Biomass and Geothermal. Hydro Power is excluded.

### Something similar is happening in Bangladesh

Something similar is happening in Bangladesh, where economic growth is led by household consumption. This consumption is driven by employment in garment factories, as well as remittances sent home by Bangladeshi nationals working overseas. With the garment sector playing a major role in the economy, the Rana Plaza tragedy in 2013 – where more than 1,100 workers died after a building housing several garment factories collapsed – was a major turning point. Global buyers have since increased the safety and labour standards they require from suppliers. As such, we believe Bangladesh can continue to gain market share in the global exports of garments.

The country is also starting to make its mark in other industries. Domestic consumer goods companies are beginning to export overseas, foreign automobile and mobile phone manufacturers have built production facilities in the country, and Bangladesh's pharmaceuticals companies have received approval to export to developed markets. All this will mean increasing foreign participation in Bangladesh's growth story, which we believe will, in turn, put greater focus on ESG and sustainability.



#### Sustainability indices in Vietnam

Vietnam's business community has made steady progress in the area of sustainability.

- The Vietnam Business Council for Sustainable Development, established by the Vietnam Chamber of Commerce and Industry, annually recognises companies from 1,500 firms across different sectors based on a Corporate Sustainability Index (CSI).
- Separately, the Ho Chi Minh Stock Exchange (HOSE) launched the Vietnam Sustainability Index (VNSI) in 2017. The VNSI is a market capitalisation-weighted, free float-adjusted index comprising listed companies with the highest scores on sustainability based on more than 100 criteria. The constituents of the VNSI are selected from the VN100 Index, a market capitalisation-weighted, free float-adjusted index of the 100 largest companies listed on the HOSE. The VNSI was launched by the HOSE, the German Cooperation Agency (GIZ) and the State Securities Commission of Vietnam<sup>2</sup>. Companies need to fulfil criteria based on the OECD principles of corporate governance and Global Standards for Sustainability Reporting (GRI) to be included in the index.





## Climate change, responses, and green financing

- Vietnam is one of the top five countries likely to be affected by climate change; Bangladesh is vulnerable as well
- We look at what both countries are doing to offset the threats
- Some progress has been made, but large amounts of investment are still required

#### Investors will demand more from businesses

The UN's climate science body, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), has released the first of a series of reports as part of its sixth assessment cycle (AR6). The report finds that: "It is unequivocal that human influence has warmed the atmosphere, ocean and land".

Wai-Shin Chan, Head of HSBC's Climate Change Centre of Excellence and Global Head of ESG Research, argues that investors will demand more from businesses: for companies in high-carbon activities to rethink their business models and strategies, for industries to be more innovative in low-carbon solutions, and for all segments of the economy to prepare for the impacts of climate change. With attention rapidly turning to COP26 in November, climate change will remain high on the agenda as 'make-or-break' discussions occur before the next AR6 reports in early 2022.

The World Bank believes Vietnam is one of the top five countries likely to be affected by climate change as the majority of its population lives in coastal lowlands. The World Bank also estimates that climate change will reduce the country's national income by up to 3.5% by 2050<sup>3</sup>; 37% of the population live in low-lying areas, which make up only 15% of the country's land area.

Climate change is also a key risk for Bangladesh. It is one of the most vulnerable countries in Southeast Asia as it is surrounded by three rivers – the Ganges River (Ganga), the Brahmaputra River and the Meghna River – with a large population living in coastal areas. The agriculture sector is most impacted and is expected to face 45significant yield reduction. Bangladesh is prone to river flooding, river bank erosion, forest fires, landslides and tropical cyclones.

"It is unequivocal that human influence has warmed the atmosphere, ocean and land."

The World Bank believes Vietnam is one of the top five countries likely to be affected by climate change





#### Vietnam and Bangladesh are both exposed to threats of rising sea levels

#### Vietnam and Bangladesh: Tracking sustainable development goals

The United Nations (UN) has laid down 17 SDGs aimed at achieving better and long-term social and environmental development around the world. Vietnam and Bangladesh have both set goals for each of the 17 SDGs. Vietnam is currently ranked 51st out of 165 countries with a SDG index score of 72.8; Bangladesh is ranked 109th with a score of 63.5 (according to The Decade of Action for the Sustainable Development Goals: Sustainable Development Report 2021; Cambridge University Press; Sachs, J., Kroll, C., Lafortune, G., Fuller, G., Woelm, F.).

Based on the above analysis of the 17 SDGs, Vietnam is on track to achieve five goals and Bangladesh three goals; however, both countries are close to hitting the targets of another 6-7 goals. We acknowledge the limitations of the data. For some categories, the latest data points go back to only 2017 or 2018. Clearly, much has changed in both countries since then; still, we think these numbers do help to identify clear trends and support our conclusion that, based on most indicators, Vietnam and Bangladesh are both heading in the right direction.

HSBC ESG analysts have done a detailed analysis of more than 50 indicators in 77 countries across developed, emerging and frontier markets. These indicators capture trends in energy transition, climate risks, climate governance and green opportunities. Vietnam is ranked 53rd and Bangladesh 76th.

Please contact <u>AskResearch@hsbc.com.hk</u> for the data or more details about Vietnam, Bangladesh and the UN's 17 SDGs.

#### Vietnam – climate challenges and responses

Vietnam has an extensive coastline with a warm climate and the country's geographical location and topography are both factors that contribute to the occurrence of natural disasters.

#### Steps taken by Vietnam to address climate change

Rapid growth and industrialisation have made it more difficult for Vietnam to control the impact of climate change, given the growing demand for land and water. However, the country is taking action to minimise the effects.

For example, Vietnam signed the Paris Agreement in 2016, committing to focus on reducing GHG emissions by at least 8% by 2030<sup>4</sup> and achieve the UN's SDGs by 2030. An updated



version of the 2014 Law on Environmental Protection is expected to be implemented by the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment of Vietnam (MONRE) from 1 January 2022. The MONRE has also announced plans for mitigating GHG emissions. The proposals include:

#### Key national policies and strategies

Policy/Strategy/Plan	Status
Nationally Determined Contribution to UNFCCC	Submitted
Financing Vietnam's Response to Climate Change (Vietnam's	Completed
Climate Public Expenditure and Investment Review)	
Law on Natural Disaster Prevention and Control	Enacted
Technology Needs Assessment for Climate Change Adaptation	Completed
National Strategy on Climate Change	Enacted
National Communications to the UNFCCC	Three submitted
Source: World Bank	

#### New draft proposal for the National Power Development Plan

Changes to the draft law for 2021-30 were made in February 2021. A total investment of USD128.3bn will be required – USD95.4bn for power generation and USD32.9bn for power grids. For 2031-45, the investment proposed will amount to USD192.3bn – USD140.2bn for power generation and USD52.1bn for power grids. For more details, see the tables below.

#### Changing power mix

Power mix	2021-30 target
Coal-fired power	Reduction of usage from 34% in 2020 to 27% in 2030; no additional development of new coal-fired thermal power plants.
Gas power	Gas power resources to rise from about 7 GW in 2020 to 13.5 GW in 2025 and 28- 33 GW in 2030; the ratio of gas-to-power sources to increase from 15% in 2020 to 21-23% in 2030.
Wind power	Capacity to rise from about 600 MW in 2020 to over 11-12 GW in 2025 and over 18- 19 GW in 2030; the ratio of wind power capacity is to account for 12% of the total installed capacity in 2025 and 13% in 2030 (compared to 0.9% in 2020).
Solar power	Capacity of about 17 GW in 2020-25 to rise to about 19-20 GW in 2030; the ratio of solar power-to-total capacity to account for 17% in 2025 and 14% in 2030.
Other	Total capacity, including battery energy and pumped storage, to reach 2.6-2.8 GW in 2030, accounting for nearly 2% of total installed capacity.

Source: Baker McKenzie, HSBC

#### Scale of power sources in Vietnam

Total installed capacity (MW)	2020	Draft 2025	Draft 2030
Thermal and LNG	29,461	43,578	66,194
Hydropower	20,685	24,497	25,992
Wind power	630	11,320	18,010
Solar power	16,640	17,240	18,640
Biomass and other renewables	570	2,050	3,150
Other	1,272	3,508	5,677
Source: Baker McKenzie, HSBC			

#### Bangladesh – climate change challenges and actions taken

Bangladesh had per capita GDP of USD1,970 in 2020. According to the World Bank, economic losses over the past 40 years were at an estimated USD12bn as of 2016, depressing GDP by 0.5-1% annually. Between 1947 and 2015, around 20 severe cyclones hit Bangladesh, causing significant loss of life and property damage. The estimated impact from disasters was:

 2007: Cyclone Sidr – damage estimated at USD1.7bn (2.6% of GDP); monsoon flooding caused losses of USD1.1bn<sup>5</sup>.

5 "Bangladesh: Building Resilience to Climate Change", World Bank, 9 October 2016



 May 2009: Cyclone Alia – impacted close to 3.9m Bangladeshis, causing damage estimated at USD270m<sup>6</sup>.

For the period until 2100, the IPCC finds that an increase in the sea level of 9-88 cm is possible. Also, a 45cm rise in the sea level is projected to swamp 75% of the Sundarbans – a mangrove area in the delta formed by the confluence of the Ganges River, the Brahmaputra River and the Meghna Rivers in the Bay of Bengal. And a one-metre rise in the sea level would flood 18% of the total land, impacting 11% of the population.

As part of the Paris Agreement, Bangladesh has proposed unconditional reductions in GHG emission of 12m tons (5%) in business-as-usual (BAU) and 24m tons (10%), conditional on international support by 2030 (base year: 2011).

One of the major goals is to eradicate poverty. However, Bangladesh cannot achieve this without making climate change an inherent part of its development strategy. As of 2016, Bangladesh has invested more than USD10bn in measures to embed resilience, including strengthening river banks, building emergency cyclone shelters, improving farming systems, and reducing saline water intrusion. The World Bank, the International Finance Corporation (IFC) and the 2030 Water Resources Group have collaborated to put forward an investment strategy for the Bangladesh Delta Plan 2100.

#### **Green financing**

The UN has been working with banks and financial regulators in different countries to direct financial flows to support SDGs. The main areas of green financing focus on: 1) helping the public sector to create an enabling environment; 2) promoting public-private partnerships via financing mechanisms; and 3) building micro-credit capacity among community enterprises. Green bonds are a common form of green financing for climate and environmental projects.

Vietnam is one of the most carbon-intensive economies in Asia

Vietnam is one of the most carbon-intensive economies in Asia, after China and Mongolia. The country issued its first green bonds in 2019 through the Government's Decree 163. This created more channels to mobilise capital for environmental protection instead of relying solely on traditional financing from banks. In 2020, Vietnam received its first green loan for developing the largest solar plant in Southeast Asia. The plant is forecast to decrease carbon emissions by c100,000 tons every year.

#### Green financing in Vietnam

Financial partnership	Purpose of loan	Loan amount
Vietcom Bank/Japan International	Financing capital for solar and wind	USD200m
Cooperation Bank	power projects in Vietnam	
Agribank/Central Power Cooperation	Construction of Central Power Solar	VND1.3trn
	Project in Khanh Hoa province	
TP Bank/Global Climate Partnership Fund	Long-term green credit loan	USD20m

Source: HSBC

According to the 2017 Global Infrastructure Outlook (from Green Infrastructure Investment Opportunities (GIIO) Vietnam, 2019, by the Climate Bond Initiatives and the European Climate Foundation), Vietnam requires infrastructure investment of USD605bn in 2016-40, leaving a gap of USD102bn after adjusting for current investment estimates.

The Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI), in partnership with Luxembourg and the Ministry of Finance, signed the "VN10 Viet Nam Green Bond Readiness" programme in October 2020. This proposal aims to enhance institutional capacity and the regulatory framework, combined with practical experience in piloting of green bond issuance. The focus is on: 1) green bond development for both corporate and government/municipal bonds; 2) two provinces/cities and

6 (ibid)



corporates will be selected for piloting the issuance of green bonds to finance their green investment projects; and 3) global experience will be shared and knowledge of products developed. The GGGI estimates implementing a green growth strategy in Vietnam will require cUSD30bn by 2030.





Source: Global Green Growth Institute, HSBC

#### **Green financing in Bangladesh**

According to Bangladesh Bank (BA), the central bank, the country needs a total of USD650bn in infrastructure investment in 2016-40 to meet its sustainability agenda. However, current total investment amounts to only USD417bn, leaving a gap of USD233bn (see table below).

#### Mind the gap

2016-40, USDbn, 2015 prices and exchange rates	Road	Rail	Airports	Ports	Telecoms	Electricity	Water	Total
Business-as-usual investment (current trends)	139	16	7	3	60	150	42	417
Investment needed to meet best performing peers	139	26	8	3	101	250	82	609
Gap to meet best performing peers	0	10	1	0	41	100	40	192
Investment needed to meet the SDGs	139	26	8	3	101	280	93	650
Gap to meet the SDGs	0	10	1	0	41	130	51	233

Source: "Green Bonds Development in Bangladesh - A Market Landscape", Bangladesh Bank, IFC, HSBC

The government has created two flagship green funds – the Bangladesh Climate Change Trust Fund (BCCTF) and the Bangladesh Climate Change Resilience Fund (BCCRF). The BCCTF is a donor-aided fund that receive donations from various countries.

Bangladesh's energy consumption has been increasing in line with the rise in population and industrial and agricultural production. Since 2000, per capita energy consumption has almost doubled to 222.2kg. In 2018, the energy mix was natural gas (56%), biofuels (24%), oil products and crude oil (13%), coal (6%), and renewable energy (1%). Given the reliance on natural gas, the government wants to shift the focus to renewable energy.

Bangladesh's green financing increased to about BDT33,421m (USD394m) by December 2019, up 58.5% y-o-y<sup>7</sup>. There are 59 scheduled banks and 33 non-bank financial institutions (NBFIs) that are currently involved in green financing or investment activities. The IFC estimates climate-smart investment has the potential to grow to USD172bn in 2018-30. In April 2020, BA increased the size of its refinancing scheme from USD23m to USD47m for environmental-friendly projects.

<sup>7 &</sup>quot;Bangladesh among top three Asian nations promoting green financing", The Daily Star, 24 June 2020



Since 2016, BA has set a minimum target of 5% of direct green finance as a percentage of total loans<sup>8</sup>. The central bank has revised this limit in January 2021 by issuing a circular to all commercial banks and NBFCs to disburse a minimum of 15% of their loans for sustainable financing, of which 2% should be green financing<sup>9</sup>.

#### References

- 1. "Climate Risk Country Profile Vietnam", World Bank, 2020
- "For Vietnam, Greener Growth Can Reduce Climate Change Risks", International Monetary Fund (IMF) News, 9 January 2018
- "Vietnam: Major changes in the new Environmental Protection Law", Baker McKenzie, 21 June 2021
- 4. "Bangladesh: Building Resilience to Climate Change", World Bank, 9 October 2016
- "Nationally Determined Contributions 2020 (Interim) from Vision to Action", Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh, 2020
- 6. "World Bank Issues Its First 'Green Loan' to Vietnam", VoA, 28 January 2020
- "Increasing financing opportunities for green projects in Vietnam", ZICO Law, 13 September 2019
- 8. "Vietnam's renewable energy future", McKinsey, 1 May 2019
- "VN10 Viet Nam Green Bond Readiness" programme, Green Global Growth Institute (GGGI), 26 March 2021
- "Green Bonds Peaked Vietnamese Investment Community's Interest", GGGI, 26 March 2021
- 11. "Green Finance in Bangladesh: Policies, Institutions, and Challenges", Asia Development Bank Institute, November 2018
- "Bangladesh among top three Asian nations promoting green financing", The Daily Star, 24 June 2020
- "Vietnam: Key highlights of new draft of national power development plan (Draft PDP8)", Baker McKenzie, 13 March 2021
- 14. "Potential of Green Bond in Viet Nam", GGGI, September 2020
- "Green Bond Development in Bangladesh A Market landscape", Bangladesh Bank and IFC, December 2019

<sup>8 &</sup>quot;Bangladesh Sets Green Finance Minimum Target at 5% for Banks and Financial Institutions", Green Finance Platform, 2016

<sup>9</sup> Standard Bank's Khan: "Commitment to sustainable reporting key to Bangladesh banks' transparency and efficiency", The Asian Banker, 9 September 2021



## **Corporate governance codes**

- We look at corporate governance codes in Vietnam and Bangladesh and compare them with OECD practices
- Bangladesh's code of governance is mandatory...
- ...while Vietnam follows a guidance approach, although certain parts are covered by various laws

#### **Making progress**

Corporate governance is an integral part of the ESG framework, defining rules, practices and processes through which a company is controlled and directed to balance the interests of its stakeholders. Both Vietnam and Bangladesh have laid down policies and regulations that set out the minimum required by companies. While every country defines its own corporate governance code, the overall approach remains somewhat similar for each country.

Vietnam and Bangladesh have made progress in upgrading their respective governance practices to meet international standards. In Vietnam, the 'Enterprise and Securities Law' reform in 2005 provided a basic corporate governance mechanism for owners and managers of privately owned companies. In 2019, the State Securities Commission modified the Code of Corporate Governance in line with international practice to reach global standards in the medium term<sup>10</sup>. This code takes a guidance approach, although certain parts are covered under various laws and decrees.

Bangladesh first issued corporate governance guidelines in 2006, which were revised in 2012 and the latest Corporate Governance Code (CGC) was published in 2018. The CGC is mandatory and failure to comply is punishable under the penal provisions of the Securities and Exchange Ordinance, 1969, including delisting or suspension from trading.

We now compare the corporate governance principles of Vietnam and Bangladesh with those of the OECD:

- Bangladesh follows a "mandatory compliance" approach, while Vietnam's approach is "voluntary". According to the OECD, 94% of all countries follow a "comply or explain" approach.
- Boards in Bangladesh can consist of 5-20 directors, while Vietnam recommends 5-11 directors (in odd-number increments). In our analysis of large companies, on average, companies comply with these ranges.
- One fifth of all board members should be independent directors in Bangladesh vs one third in Vietnam. In the OECD, most countries recommend that 50% of all board members should be independent.
- The maximum cumulative tenure of a director is six years in Bangladesh vs nine years in Vietnam. An average of 8-10 years is the most common tenure in OECD countries.

10 "Time to upgrade corporate governance in Vietnam", East Asia Forum, 27 May 2021

Vietnam and Bangladesh have made progress in upgrading their respective governance practices



- Vietnam requires at least two members (or 30%) of the board to be female. Bangladesh has no such policy that we could find. Among OECD countries, female members constitute 20-40% of a board.
- It is mandatory to have audit, risk management, nomination and remuneration committees in Vietnam, while a risk management committee is not mandatory in Bangladesh. In the OECD, 90% of all countries require an audit committee, 24% require a nomination committee, and 32% require a remuneration committee.
- Companies in both countries need to disclose their corporate governance policies on their relevant corporate website.
- In Bangladesh, notice of board meetings should be circulated at least seven days in advance. Companies also need to meet at least once every quarter of a calendar year. In Vietnam, a 21-day notice is required and the results of votes should be disclosed within a day of the meeting. Most OECD countries have a notice period of 15-21 days.
- Both countries need to disclose the remuneration of company directors, including independent directors. In the OECD, 92% of all jurisdictions have introduced general criteria on the structure of remuneration.
- In OECD countries, 80% of all jurisdictions require immediate disclosure of related party transactions, with 82% requiring the use of International Accounting Standards, while an additional 8% allow flexibility to follow IAS 24 or the local standard. Bangladesh and Vietnam also follow a policy of disclosing related party transactions.



# ESG indicators for major companies

- HSBC Global Research has an in-house ESG proprietary database of key ESG metrics for companies under HSBC Global Research coverage
- The database uses 10 metrics to give a broad indication of the status of ESG information disclosure
- We look at ESG indicators in the annual reports of companies in the VN30 Index for Vietnam and the DS30 Index for Bangladesh

#### Analysing trends using the HSBC ESG Database

HSBC Global Research has an in-house ESG proprietary database of key ESG metrics for companies under HSBC Global Research coverage. There are around 1,900 companies under coverage globally, with around half of them in Asia Pacific, and the data are based on publicly available information. The database uses 10 metrics to give a broad indication of the status of ESG information disclosure. They are:

1. Greenhouse gas emissions intensity	6. Diversity policy
2. Total energy intensity	7. Board size
3. Carbon reduction policy	8. Average board tenure
4. Employee turnover	9. Female representation on the board
5. Employee cost as a percentage of sales	10. Board independence

We looked at the annual reports of companies in Vietnam's VN30 Index and Bangladesh's DS30 Index to find data on the 10 metrics. This helped us gauge how the companies have made improvements in various environmental, social and governance indicators over the last five years. Please contact <u>AskResearch@hsbc.com</u> for the data.



# **Disclosure appendix**

#### **Analyst Certification**

The following analyst(s), economist(s), or strategist(s) who is(are) primarily responsible for this report, including any analyst(s) whose name(s) appear(s) as author of an individual section or sections of the report and any analyst(s) named as the covering analyst(s) of a subsidiary company in a sum-of-the-parts valuation certifies(y) that the opinion(s) on the subject security(ies) or issuer(s), any views or forecasts expressed in the section(s) of which such individual(s) is(are) named as author(s), and any other views or forecasts expressed herein, including any views expressed on the back page of the research report, accurately reflect their personal view(s) and that no part of their compensation was, is or will be directly or indirectly related to the specific recommendation(s) or views contained in this research report: Devendra Joshi, Herald van der Linde, CFA and Wai-Shin Chan, CFA

#### Important disclosures

#### Equities: Stock ratings and basis for financial analysis

HSBC and its affiliates, including the issuer of this report ("HSBC") believes an investor's decision to buy or sell a stock should depend on individual circumstances such as the investor's existing holdings, risk tolerance and other considerations and that investors utilise various disciplines and investment horizons when making investment decisions. Ratings should not be used or relied on in isolation as investment advice. Different securities firms use a variety of ratings terms as well as different rating systems to describe their recommendations and therefore investors should carefully read the definitions of the ratings used in each research report. Further, investors should carefully read the entire research report and not infer its contents from the rating because research reports contain more complete information concerning the analysts' views and the basis for the rating.

#### From 23rd March 2015 HSBC has assigned ratings on the following basis:

The target price is based on the analyst's assessment of the stock's actual current value, although we expect it to take six to 12 months for the market price to reflect this. When the target price is more than 20% above the current share price, the stock will be classified as a Buy; when it is between 5% and 20% above the current share price, the stock may be classified as a Buy or a Hold; when it is between 5% above the current share price, the stock will be classified as a Hold; when it is between 5% above the current share price, the stock will be classified as a Hold; when it is between 5% and 20% below the current share price, the stock may be classified as a Hold; when it is more than 20% below the current share price, the stock may be classified as a Hold or a Reduce; and when it is more than 20% below the current share price, the stock will be classified as a Reduce.

Our ratings are re-calibrated against these bands at the time of any 'material change' (initiation or resumption of coverage, change in target price or estimates).

Upside/Downside is the percentage difference between the target price and the share price.

#### Prior to this date, HSBC's rating structure was applied on the following basis:

For each stock we set a required rate of return calculated from the cost of equity for that stock's domestic or, as appropriate, regional market established by our strategy team. The target price for a stock represented the value the analyst expected the stock to reach over our performance horizon. The performance horizon was 12 months. For a stock to be classified as Overweight, the potential return, which equals the percentage difference between the current share price and the target price, including the forecast dividend yield when indicated, had to exceed the required return by at least 5 percentage points over the succeeding 12 months (or 10 percentage points for a stock classified as Volatile\*). For a stock to be classified as Underweight, the stock was expected to underperform its required return by at least 5 percentage points over the succeeding 12 months (or 10 percentage points for a stock stock between these bands were classified as Neutral.

\*A stock was classified as volatile if its historical volatility had exceeded 40%, if the stock had been listed for less than 12 months (unless it was in an industry or sector where volatility is low) or if the analyst expected significant volatility. However, stocks which we did not consider volatile may in fact also have behaved in such a way. Historical volatility was defined as the past month's average of the daily 365-day moving average volatilities. In order to avoid misleadingly frequent changes in rating, however, volatility had to move 2.5 percentage points past the 40% benchmark in either direction for a stock's status to change.



#### Rating distribution for long-term investment opportunities

As of 10 September 2021, the distribution of all independent ratings published by HSBC is as follows:					
Buy	60%	( 31% of these provided with Investment Banking Services )			
Hold	33%	( 30% of these provided with Investment Banking Services )			
Sell	7%	(28% of these provided with Investment Banking Services)			

For the purposes of the distribution above the following mapping structure is used during the transition from the previous to current rating models: under our previous model, Overweight = Buy, Neutral = Hold and Underweight = Sell; under our current model Buy = Buy, Hold = Hold and Reduce = Sell. For rating definitions under both models, please see "Stock ratings and basis for financial analysis" above.

For the distribution of non-independent ratings published by HSBC, please see the disclosure page available at http://www.hsbcnet.com/gbm/financial-regulation/investment-recommendations-disclosures.

To view a list of all the independent fundamental ratings disseminated by HSBC during the preceding 12-month period, please use the following links to access the disclosure page:

Clients of Global Research and Global Banking and Markets: www.research.hsbc.com/A/Disclosures

Clients of HSBC Private Banking: www.research.privatebank.hsbc.com/Disclosures

HSBC and its affiliates will from time to time sell to and buy from customers the securities/instruments, both equity and debt (including derivatives) of companies covered in HSBC Research on a principal or agency basis or act as a market maker or liquidity provider in the securities/instruments mentioned in this report.

Analysts, economists, and strategists are paid in part by reference to the profitability of HSBC which includes investment banking, sales & trading, and principal trading revenues.

Whether, or in what time frame, an update of this analysis will be published is not determined in advance.

Non-U.S. analysts may not be associated persons of HSBC Securities (USA) Inc, and therefore may not be subject to FINRA Rule 2241 or FINRA Rule 2242 restrictions on communications with the subject company, public appearances and trading securities held by the analysts.

Economic sanctions imposed by the EU, the UK, the USA and certain other jurisdictions generally prohibit transacting or dealing in any debt or equity issued by Russian SSI entities on or after 16 July 2014 (Restricted SSI Securities). Economic sanctions imposed by the USA also generally prohibit US persons from purchasing or selling publicly traded securities issued by companies designated by the US Government as "Chinese Military-Industrial Complex Companies" (CMICs) or any publicly traded securities that are derivative of, or designed to provide investment exposure to, the targeted CMIC securities (collectively, Restricted CMIC Securities). This report does not constitute advice in relation to any Restricted SSI Securities or Restricted CMIC Securities, and as such, this report should not be construed as an inducement to transact in any Restricted SSI Securities or Restricted CMIC Securities.

For disclosures in respect of any company mentioned in this report, please see the most recently published report on that company available at www.hsbcnet.com/research. HSBC Private Banking clients should contact their Relationship Manager for queries regarding other research reports. In order to find out more about the proprietary models used to produce this report, please contact the authoring analyst.



#### Additional disclosures

- 1 This report is dated as at 13 September 2021.
- 2 All market data included in this report are dated as at close 10 September 2021, unless a different date and/or a specific time of day is indicated in the report.
- 3 HSBC has procedures in place to identify and manage any potential conflicts of interest that arise in connection with its Research business. HSBC's analysts and its other staff who are involved in the preparation and dissemination of Research operate and have a management reporting line independent of HSBC's Investment Banking business. Information Barrier procedures are in place between the Investment Banking, Principal Trading, and Research businesses to ensure that any confidential and/or price sensitive information is handled in an appropriate manner.
- 4 You are not permitted to use, for reference, any data in this document for the purpose of (i) determining the interest payable, or other sums due, under loan agreements or under other financial contracts or instruments, (ii) determining the price at which a financial instrument may be bought or sold or traded or redeemed, or the value of a financial instrument, and/or (iii) measuring the performance of a financial instrument or of an investment fund.



### Disclaimer

#### Legal entities as at 1 December 2020

<sup>1</sup>UAE' HSBC Bank Middle East Limited, DIFC; HSBC Bank Middle East Limited, Dubai; 'HK' The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Hong Kong; 'TW' HSBC Securities (Taiwan) Corporation Limited; 'CA' HSBC Securities (Canada) Inc.; 'France' HSBC Continental Europe; 'Spain' HSBC Continental Europe, Sucursal en España; 'Italy' HSBC Continental Europe, Italy; 'Sweden' HSBC Continental Europe Bank, Sweden Filial; 'DE' HSBC Trinkaus & Burkhardt AG, Düsseldorf; 000 HSBC Bank (RR), Moscow; 'IN' HSBC Securities and Capital Markets (India) Private Limited, Mumbai; 'JP' HSBC Securities (Japan) Limited, Tokyo; 'EG' HSBC Securities Egypt SAE, Cairo; 'CN' HSBC Investment Bank Asia Limited, Beijing Representative Office; The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Singapore Branch; The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Seoul Securities Branch; The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Seoul Branch; HSBC Securities (South Africa) (Pty) Ltd, Johannesburg; HSBC Bank plc, London, Tel Aviv; 'US' HSBC Securities (USA) Inc, New York; HSBC Yatirim Menkul Degerler AS, Istanbul; HSBC México, SA, Institución de Banca Múltiple, Grupo Financiero HSBC; HSBC Bank Australia Limited; HSBC Bank Argentina SA; HSBC Saudi Arabia Limited; The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Seudi Arabia Limited; The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, New Zealand Branch incorporated in Hong Kong SAR; The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Bangkok Branch; PT Bank HSBC Indonesia; HSBC Qianhai Securities Limited; Banco HSBC S.A.

Issuer of report The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited Level 19, 1 Queen's Road Central Hong Kong SAR Telephone: +852 2843 9111 Fax: +852 2596 0200 Website: www.research.hsbc.com

This document has been issued by The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited ("HSBC") in the conduct of its Hong Kong regulated business for the information of its institutional and professional investor (as defined by Securities and Future Ordinance (Chapter 571)) customers; it is not intended for and should not be distributed to retail customers in Hong Kong. The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited is regulated by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority. All enquires by recipients in Hong Kong must be directed to your HSBC contact in Hong Kong. If it is received by a customer of an affiliate of HSBC, its provision to the recipient is subject to the terms of business in place between the recipient and such affiliate. This document is not and should not be construed as an offer to sell or the solicitation of an offer to purchase or subscribe for any investment. HSBC has based this document on information obtained from sources it believes to be reliable but which it has not independently verified; HSBC makes no guarantee, representation or warranty and accepts no responsibility or liability as to its accuracy or completeness. Expressions of opinion are those of the Research Division of HSBC only and are subject to change without notice. From time to time research analysts conduct site visits of covered issuers. HSBC policies prohibit research analysts from accepting payment or reimbursement for travel expenses from the issuer for such visits. HSBC and its affiliates and/or their officers, directors and employees may have positions in any securities mentioned in this document (or in any related investment). HSBC and its affiliates may act as market maker or have assumed an underwriting commitment in the securities of companies discussed for or investments), may sell them to or buy them from customers on a principal basis and may also perform or seek to perform investment banking or underwriting services for or relating to those companies.

HSBC Securities (USA) Inc. accepts responsibility for the content of this research report prepared by its non-US foreign affiliate. The information contained herein is under no circumstances to be construed as investment advice and is not tailored to the needs of the recipient. All U.S. persons receiving and/or accessing this report and wishing to effect transactions in any security discussed herein should do so with HSBC Securities (USA) Inc. in the United States and not with its non-US foreign affiliate, the issuer of this report.

In the UK, this publication is distributed by HSBC Bank plc for the information of its Clients (as defined in the Rules of FCA) and those of its affiliates only. Nothing herein excludes or restricts any duty or liability to a customer which HSBC Bank plc has under the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 or under the Rules of FCA and PRA. A recipient who chooses to deal with any person who is not a representative of HSBC Bank plc in the UK will not enjoy the protections afforded by the UK regulatory regime. HSBC Bank plc is regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and the Prudential Regulation Authority. In Singapore, this publication is distributed by The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Singapore Branch for the general information of institutional investors or other persons specified in Sections 274 and 304 of the Securities and Futures Act (Chapter 289) ("SFA") and accredited investors and other persons in accordance with the conditions specified in Sections 275 and 305 of the SFA. Only Economics or Currencies reports are intended for distribution to a person who is not an Accredited Investor, Expert Investor or Institutional Investors Regulations in its publication is not a prospectus as defined in the SFA. The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Singapore Branch is regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore. Recipients in Singapore should contact a "Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited Singapore Branch is regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore. Please refer to The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited (ABN 48 006 434 162, AFSL No. 232595). These respective entities and fuerties and for distributed by The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited (ABN 48 006 434 162, AFSL No. 232595). These respective entities make no representations that the products or services mentioned in this document are available to persons in Australia or are necessarily suitable for any particular person or appropriate in accordance with local

In the European Economic Area, this publication has been distributed by HSBC Continental Europe or by such other HSBC affiliate from which the recipient receives relevant services.

In Japan, this publication has been distributed by HSBC Securities (Japan) Limited. It may not be further distributed in whole or in part for any purpose. In Korea, this publication is distributed by The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, Securities Branch ("HBAP SLS") for the general information of professional investors specified in Article 9 of the Financial Investment Services and Capital Markets Act ("FSCMA"). This publication is not a prospectus as defined in the FSCMA. It may not be further distributed in whole or in part for any purpose. HBAP SLS is regulated by the Financial Services Commission and the Financial Supervisory Service of Korea.

In Canada, this document has been distributed by HSBC Securities (Canada) Inc. (member IIROC), and/or its affiliates. The information contained herein is under no circumstances to be construed as investment advice in any province or territory of Canada and is not tailored to the needs of the recipient. No securities commission or similar regulatory authority in Canada has reviewed or in any way passed judgment upon these materials, the information contained herein or the merits of the securities described herein, and any representation to the contrary is an offense. In Brazil, this document has been distributed by Banco HSBC S.A. ("HSBC Brazil"), and/or its affiliates. As required by Instruction No. 598/18 of the Securities and Exchange Commission of Brazil (Comissão de Valores Mobiliários), potential conflicts of interest concerning (i) HSBC Brazil and/or its affiliates; and (ii) the analyst(s) responsible for authoring this report are stated on the chart above labelled "HSBC & Analyst Disclosures".

If you are an HSBC Private Banking ("PB") customer with approval for receipt of relevant research publications by an applicable HSBC legal entity, you are eligible to receive this publication. To be eligible to receive such publications, you must have agreed to the applicable HSBC entity's terms and conditions for accessing research and the terms and conditions of any other internet banking service offered by that HSBC entity through which you will access research publications ("the Terms"). Distribution of this publication is the sole responsibility of the HSBC entity with whom you have agreed the Terms. If you do not meet the aforementioned eligibility requirements please disregard this publication and, if you are a customer of PB, please notify your Relationship Manager. Receipt of research publications is strictly subject to the Terms and any other conditions or disclaimers applicable to the provision of the publications that may be advised by PB.

© Copyright 2021, The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited, ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, on any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of The Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited. MCI (P) 028/02/2021, MCI (P) 087/10/2020